The 390th meeting of the Holyoke Community College Board of Trustees was held on Tuesday, September 22, 2020, remotely with Chair Robert W. Gilbert, Jr. presiding.

| MEMBERS PRESENT | Robert W. Gilbert, Jr., Chair  
| José Delgado  
| Trustee Gi  
| Ted Hebert  
| Yolanda Johnson  
| Lucy Perez  
| Evan Plotkin  
| Ivonne Vidal  
| Suzanne Parker, Vice Chair  
| Charles Epstein, Julie Pokela  
| Jose Delgado  
| Trustee Gi  
| Ted Hebert  
| Yolanda Johnson  
| Lucy Perez  
| Evan Plotkin  
| Ivonne Vidal  
| Suzanne Parker, Vice Chair  
| Charles Epstein, Julie Pokela  
| Jose Delgado  
| Trustee Gi  
| Ted Hebert  
| Yolanda Johnson  
| Lucy Perez  
| Evan Plotkin  
| Ivonne Vidal  
| Suzanne Parker, Vice Chair  
| Charles Epstein, Julie Pokela  
| Jose Delgado  
| Trustee Gi  
| Ted Hebert  
| Yolanda Johnson  
| Lucy Perez  
| Evan Plotkin  
| Ivonne Vidal  
| Suzanne Parker, Vice Chair  
| Charles Epstein, Julie Pokela  
| Jose Delgado  
| Trustee Gi  
| Ted Hebert  
| Yolanda Johnson  
| Lucy Perez  
| Evan Plotkin  
| Ivonne Vidal  
| Suzanne Parker, Vice Chair  
| Charles Epstein, Julie Pokela  
| Jose Delgado  
| Trustee Gi  
| Ted Hebert  
| Yolanda Johnson  
| Lucy Perez  
| Evan Plotkin  
| Ivonne Vidal  
| Suzanne Parker, Vice Chair  
| Charles Epstein, Julie Pokela  
| Jose Delgado  
| Trustee Gi  
| Ted Hebert  
| Yolanda Johnson  
| Lucy Perez  
| Evan Plotkin  
| Ivonne Vidal  
| Suzanne Parker, Vice Chair  
| Charles Epstein, Julie Pokela  
| Jose Delgado  
| Trustee Gi  
| Ted Hebert  
| Yolanda Johnson  
| Lucy Perez  
| Evan Plotkin  
| Ivonne Vidal  
| Suzanne Parker, Vice Chair  
| Charles Epstein, Julie Pokela  
| Jose Delgado  
| Trustee Gi  
| Ted Hebert  
| Yolanda Johnson  
| Lucy Perez  
| Evan Plotkin  
| Ivonne Vidal  
| Suzanne Parker, Vice Chair  
| Charles Epstein, Julie Pokela  
| Jose Delgado  
| Trustee Gi  
| Ted Hebert  
| Yolanda Johnson  
| Lucy Perez  
| Evan Plotkin  
| Ivonne Vidal  
| Suzanne Parker, Vice Chair  
| Charles Epstein, Julie Pokela  
| Jose Delgado  
| Trustee Gi  
| Ted Hebert  
| Yolanda Johnson  
| Lucy Perez  
| Evan Plotkin  
| Ivonne Vidal  
| Suzanne Parker, Vice Chair  
| Charles Epstein, Julie Pokela  
| Jose Delgado  
| Trustee Gi  
| Ted Hebert  
| Yolanda Johnson  
| Lucy Perez  
| Evan Plotkin  
| Ivonne Vidal  
| Suzanne Parker, Vice Chair  
| Charles Epstein, Julie Pokela  
| Jose Delgado  
| Trustee Gi  
| Ted Hebert  
| Yolanda Johnson  
| Lucy Perez  
| Evan Plotkin  
| Ivonne Vidal  
| Suzanne Parker, Vice Chair  
| Charles Epstein, Julie Pokela  
| Jose Delgado  
| Trustee Gi  
| Ted Hebert  
| Yolanda Johnson  
| Lucy Perez  
| Evan Plotkin  
| Ivonne Vidal  
| Suzanne Parker, Vice Chair  
| Charles Epstein, Julie Pokela  
| Jose Delgado  
| Trustee Gi  
| Ted Hebert  
| Yolanda Johnson  
| Lucy Perez  
| Evan Plotkin  
| Ivonne Vidal  
| Suzanne Parker, Vice Chair  
| Charles Epstein, Julie Pokela  
| Jose Delgado  
| Trustee Gi  
| Ted Hebert  
| Yolanda Johnson  
| Lucy Perez  
| Evan Plotkin  
| Ivonne Vidal  
| Suzanne Parker, Vice Chair  
| Charles Epstein, Julie Pokela  
| Jose Delgado  
| Trustee Gi  
| Ted Hebert  
| Yolanda Johnson  
| Lucy Perez  
| Evan Plotkin  
| Ivonne Vidal  
| Suzanne Parker, Vice Chair  
| Charles Epstein, Julie Pokela  
| Jose Delgado  
| Trustee Gi  
| Ted Hebert  
| Yolanda Johnson  
| Lucy Perez  
| Evan Plotkin  
| Ivonne Vidal  
| Suzanne Parker, Vice Chair  
| Charles Epstein, Julie Pokela  
| Jose Delgado  
| Trustee Gi  
| Ted Hebert  
| Yolanda Johnson  
| Lucy Perez  
| Evan Plotkin  
| Ivonne Vidal  
| Suzanne Parker, Vice Chair  
| Charles Epstein, Julie Pokela  
| Jose Delgado  
| Trustee Gi  
| Ted Hebert  
| Yolanda Johnson  
| Lucy Perez  
| Evan Plotkin  
| Ivonne Vidal  
| Suzanne Parker, Vice Chair  
| Charles Epstein, Julie Pokela  
| Jose Delgado  
| Trustee Gi  
| Ted Hebert  
| Yolanda Johnson  
| Lucy Perez  
| Evan Plotkin  
| Ivonne Vidal  
| Suzanne Parker, Vice Chair  
| Charles Epstein, Julie Pokela  
| Jose Delgado  
| Trustee Gi  
| Ted Hebert  
| Yolanda Johnson  
| Lucy Perez  
| Evan Plotkin  
| Ivonne Vidal  
| Suzanne Parker, Vice Chair  
| Charles Epstein, Julie Pokela  
| Jose Delgado  
| Trustee Gi  
| Ted Hebert  
| Yolanda Johnson  
| Lucy Perez  
| Evan Plotkin  
| Ivonne Vidal  
| Suzanne Parker, Vice Chair  
| Charles Epstein, Julie Pokela  
| Jose Delgado  
| Trustee Gi  
| Ted Hebert  
| Yolanda Johnson  
| Lucy Perez  
| Evan Plotkin  
| Ivonne Vidal  
| Suzanne Parker, Vice Chair  
| Charles Epstein, Julie Pokela  
| Jose Delgado  
| Trustee Gi  
| Ted Hebert  
| Yolanda Johnson  
| Lucy Perez  
| Evan Plotkin  
| Ivonne Vidal  
| Suzanne Parker, Vice Chair  
| Charles Epstein, Julie Pokela  
| Jose Delgado  
| Trustee Gi  
| Ted Hebert  
| Yolanda Johnson  
| Lucy Perez  
| Evan Plotkin  
| Ivonne Vidal  
| Suzanne Parker, Vice Chair  
| Charles Epstein, Julie Pokela  
| Jose Delgado  
| Trustee Gi  
| Ted Hebert  
| Yolanda Johnson  
| Lucy Perez  
| Evan Plotkin  
| Ivonne Vidal  
| Suzanne Parker, Vice Chair  
| Charles Epstein, Julie Pokela  
| Jose Delgado  
| Trustee Gi  
| Ted Hebert  
| Yolanda Johnson  
| Lucy Perez  
| Evan Plotkin  
| Ivonne Vidal  
| Suzanne Parker, Vice Chair  
| Charles Epstein, Julie Pokela  
| Jose Delgado  
| Trustee Gi  
| Ted Hebert  
| Yolanda Johnson  
| Lucy Perez  
| Evan Plotkin  
| Ivonne Vidal  
| Suzanne Parker, Vice Chair  
| Charles Epstein, Julie Pokela  
| Jose Delgado  
| Trustee Gi  
| Ted Hebert  
| Yolanda Johnson  
| Lucy Perez  
| Evan Plotkin  
| Ivonne Vidal  
| Suzanne Parker, Vice Chair  
| Charles Epstein, Julie Pokela  
| Jose Delgado  
| Trustee Gi  
| Ted Hebert  
| Yolanda Johnson  
| Lucy Perez  
| Evan Plotkin  
| Ivonne Vidal  
| Suzanne Parker, Vice Chair  
| Charles Epstein, Julie Pokela  
| Jose Delgado  
| Trustee Gi  
| Ted Hebert  
| Yolanda Johnson  
| Lucy Perez  
| Evan Plotkin  
| Ivonne Vidal  
| Suzanne Parker, Vice Chair  
| Charles Epstein, Julie Pokela  
| Jose Delgado  
| Trustee Gi  
| Ted Hebert  
| Yolanda Johnson  
| Lucy Perez  
| Evan Plotkin  
| Ivonne Vidal  
| Suzanne Parker, Vice Chair  
| Charles Epstein, Julie Pokela  
| Jose Delgado  
| Trustee Gi  
| Ted Hebert  
| Yolanda Johnson  
| Lucy Perez  
| Evan Plotkin  
| Ivonne Vidal  
| Suzanne Parker, Vice Chair  
| Charles Epstein, Julie Pokela  
| Jose Delgado  
| Trustee Gi  
| Ted Hebert  
| Yolanda Johnson  
| Lucy Perez  
| Evan Plotkin  
| Ivonne Vidal  
| Suzanne Parker, Vice Chair  
| Charles Epstein, Julie Pokela  
| Jose Delgado  
| Trustee Gi  
| Ted Hebert  
| Yolanda Johnson  
| Lucy Perez  
| Evan Plotkin  
| Ivonne Vidal  
| Suzanne Parker, Vice Chair  
| Charles Epstein, Julie Pokela  
| Jose Delgado  
| Trustee Gi  
| Ted Hebert  
| Yolanda Johnson  
| Lucy Perez  
| Evan Plotkin  
| Ivonne Vidal  
| Suzanne Parker, Vice Chair  
| Charles Epstein, Julie Pokela  
| Jose Delgado  
| Trustee Gi  
| Ted Heber
• 62% are part-time students;
• 32% are First Time Degree Seeking;
• Course completion of Black students for Fall 2019 was 65%, versus 81% for White students.

2. ORIGINAL Student guest speaker – Diamond Smith:
   • Co-President of the College’s Black Student Alliance Club
   • Liberal Arts Major, with an interest in Freelance Journalism.
   • Active participation in the College’s George Floyd Forum.
   • Has enjoyed her time attending classes at HCC, particularly LC courses.
   • Conducted many interviews regarding Juneteenth, which led to an article based on dialog from an event.
   • She appreciated staff and faculty’s care during her struggle with her mother’s health, even if they did not know what she was struggling with.

CORRECTION Student guest speaker – Diamond Smith:
   • Ms. Smith shared her difficult personal journey that led her to Holyoke Community College

**Roll Call Vote:**
- Trustee Delgado: Yes
- Trustee Hebert: Yes
- Trustee Gi: Yes
- Trustee Johnson: Yes
- Trustee Parker: Yes
- Trustee Perez: Yes
- Trustee Plotkin: Yes
- Trustee Vidal: Yes
- Trustee Gilbert: Yes

**APPROVAL OF PERSONNEL ACTIONS**

On a motion by Trustee Vidal and seconded by Trustee Perez it was VOTED to approve the September 22, 2020 personnel actions reports for Appointments and Reappointments for Non-Unit Professional, MCCC Unit Professional Staff, and Faculty.

**Roll Call Vote:**
- Trustee Delgado: Yes
- Trustee Hebert: Yes
- Trustee Gi: Yes
- Trustee Johnson: Yes
- Trustee Parker: Yes
- Trustee Perez: Yes
- Trustee Plotkin: Yes
- Trustee Vidal: Yes
- Trustee Gilbert: Yes

On a motion by Trustee Plotkin and seconded by Trustee Hebert it was VOTED to empower the President of the College to approve all personnel actions prior to the next meeting.

**Roll Call Vote:**
- Trustee Delgado: Yes
- Trustee Hebert: Yes
- Trustee Gi: Yes
- Trustee Johnson: Yes
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Trustee Parker</th>
<th>Yes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Trustee Perez</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trustee Plotkin</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trustee Vidal</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trustee Gilbert</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**CONSENT AGENDA**

On a motion by Trustee Perez and seconded by Trustee Johnson it was **VOTED** to adopt a Consent Agenda effective October 2020.

**Roll Call Vote:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Trustee Delgado</th>
<th>Yes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Trustee Hebert</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trustee Gi</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trustee Johnson</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trustee Parker</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trustee Perez</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trustee Plotkin</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trustee Vidal</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trustee Gilbert</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**FINANCE COMMITTEE REPORT**

Finance Committee Report presented by Narayan Sampath, Vice President of Administration & Finance:
September 22, 2020
Board of Trustees

Request of the Board:

To approve the FY 2021 balanced budget for the General Operating Trust Fund, the Restricted and Sponsored Activity Trust Funds, the Auxiliary Enterprises Trust Fund, and the Reserve Draw as presented with the express approval of all purchases in any amount, to authorize the President or her designee to transfer among subsidiaries as needed during the fiscal year.
FY 2021 Budget Assumptions

- 5% decline in State Appropriations
- 15% decline in enrollment in terms of absolute dollars and 17% with respect to number of credits
- FY21 shortfall of $2M (balanced with Federal + State funding)
  - Systemic fiscal challenge: Approximately $2.5M to $4M
- Annual budget of about $50.8M compared to $54.6M in FY20, a reduction of about 7%

*Three month interim budget for $13M was approved by the Board in June 2020*

How did we get here?

- A decade of declining enrollment. From 2010:
  - Headcount down from 7,404 to 4,700, a 43% decline
  - Credits down from 141,376 to 93,094, a 36% decline
  - FTE down from 5,092 to 5,900, a 40% decline
- However, staffing not aligned with critical metrics
  - About 400 full time benefitted staff since 2015
- Challenges exacerbated by COVID-19

*Staffing levels compared to revenue metrics are not aligned*
From 2010 to 2019, FTE went from 9,692 to 5,805 and Credits went from 145,376 to 93,000.

Staffing levels don’t keep up with enrollment and credits. Staffing from 2015 to 2021 is down 3%, where as Credits are down 34%.
**Staffing v/s Operational Expenses**

**Staffing is down 3% but expenses are up 18%, from about $43M in 2016 to over $50M last year**

**Personnel Expenses**

Salary + Fringe of Full Time Employees is about 68% of the total budget

With part time employees including TChE faculty it's 75%
Steps taken to address shortfall

- Steps taken
  - Reduced expenses by 7% for FY21
  - Every position including part-time positions are reviewed and discussed at Cabinet
  - Program Prioritization
  - Budget Committee formed
  - Reduced PTNB by 33 positions – March 2020
  - Offered Early Retirement Incentive (Sept 2020)
  - Offer Voluntary Unpaid Leave Options (Sept 2020)
  - Build Future Budgets Based on Realistic Enrollment (FY21 & 22)

Future steps to address shortfall

- Reassess shortfall after Oct 9th (Early retirement & Unpaid leave options)
- More difficult difficult decisions are likely
- Aggressively pursue grant opportunities (present-future)
- Enhance Donor & Alumni Engagement (present-future)
- Investing and diversifying sources of revenue – new academic and workforce programs
A discussion ensued regarding early retirements and voluntary leave options.

On a motion by Trustee Hebert and seconded by Trustee Perez it was **VOTED** to approve the FY 2021 balanced budgets for the General Operating Trust Fund, the Restricted and Sponsored Activity Trust Funds, the Auxiliary Enterprises Trust Fund, and the Reserve Draw as presented with the express approval of all purchases in any amount, to authorize the President or her designee to transfer among subsidiaries as needed during the fiscal year.

**Roll Call Vote:**

- Trustee Delgado: Yes
- Trustee Hebert: Yes
- Trustee Gi: Yes
- Trustee Johnson: Yes
- Trustee Parker: Yes
- Trustee Perez: Yes
- Trustee Plotkin: Yes
- Trustee Vidal: Yes
- Trustee Gilbert: Yes

### COMMITTEE REPORTS

**Advocacy Committee – Report provided by President Royal**

President Royal has been in communication with Holyoke’s State Representative-Elect Pat Duffy and State Senator John Velis. The college will be conducting a virtual briefing with local legislators on Monday, October 19, 2020.

**Audit & Finance Committee**

No report.

**Bylaws and Governance Committee – Report provided by Trustee Vidal**

Using a template provided by the State’s governing body, a meeting will be convened to rewrite and modernize the Board’s By-Laws.
**Equity Committee (EC) – Report provided by Trustee Johnson**

Having conversations as to “Why” equity is important is necessary for the college as it builds a better community, and provides people with pathways to a good paying job and improved health.

As part of the Equity Initiative, there will be an added focus on hiring employees of color, mental health, adult learners, ALANA, and expanding mentorship opportunities.

A discussion ensued regarding the Board adopting a statement on its commitment to equity and anti-racism. The Committee will present a draft to the Board at its next meeting. Trustee Gi stated that the students would appreciate a similar message from Faculty. Trustee Gi would also like to see disability equity to be addressed as well.

**Nominating Committee – Report provided by Trustee Johnson**

The committee will need to nominate a new Secretary.

**Presidential Evaluation Committee**

No report

**Strategic Plan Committee – Report provided by Trustee Plotkin**

- For Year 2 of the Strategic Plan, there will be a shift from teams to project based workgroups
- Trustee Plotkin met with Director of Planning, Kris Ricker Choleva.
- On 9/21/20, the college held a town hall to discuss draft projects and to call for volunteers for those projects.

**REPORT OF THE CHAIR**

- When discussing governance at the Board retreat, the idea of self-evaluation was introduced.
- Developing closer relationships with faculty and staff by the Board is important for the direction and future of the college.
- Chair Gilbert conducted weekly zoom meetings with President Royal.
- Chair Gilbert thanked President Royal on her work with the Lumina Grant and her participation on their 9/14/20 panel.

**PRESIDENT’S REPORT**

**Black Student Lives Matter Fall 2020 Series**

Student guest speaker – Safiyah Bey:

- Ms. Bey shared her personal journey to Holyoke Community College with the Board.

Trustee Hebert thanked Ms. Bey for sharing her story. President Royal thanked Ms. Bey for joining her this morning.

**Strategic Plan In-Depth Topic: NECHE Accreditation – presented by Rachel Rubinstein**
NECHE and Accreditation

- The New England Commission of Higher Education is the regional accreditation agency for colleges and universities in Connecticut, Maine, Massachusetts, New Hampshire, Rhode Island, and Vermont.
- Recognized by the U.S. Secretary of Education and by the Council for Higher Education Accreditation (CHEA), affirming that its standards and processes are consistent with the quality, improvement, and accountability expectations that CHEA has established.
- Accreditation is a status that provides assurance to prospective students, their families and the general public that an institution meets clearly stated Standards for Accreditation and will continue to meet those standards in the future.

The Comprehensive Evaluation Process

- Institutions undergo a comprehensive evaluation at least every ten years.
- The process has three components:
  - an institutional self-study, in which the institution evaluates how and how well it meets the Commission’s Standards for Accreditation;
  - an on-site evaluation by a group of peers;
  - a review and decision by the Commission.
The Comprehensive Evaluation Process

- Our preparations included:
  - Writing of the Self-Study (2-year process)
  - Self-Study is a widely shared document (BOT has access to digital and hard copy)
  - Orientation with Visiting Team Chair and with NECHE staff
  - Preparing all stakeholders on campus, from Board to frontline staff
  - Because of pandemic, all NECHE visits in Fall 2020 are virtual
    - October 4th-7th, 2020
    - One team member will attend in person
    - What does a virtual visit look like?

Highlights from the Self-Study

Strengths
- Highly qualified and caring faculty
- Rich and robust academic program
- Broad array of student support programs
- Healthy reserves and robust grants development

Challenges
- Persistent equity gaps
- Culture of assessment and data-informed decision-making not fully integrated across the whole campus
- Environmental challenges: long-term enrollment decline; Covid-19; state appropriations

Standards for Accreditation

Standard 1: Mission and Purpose
Standard 2: Planning and Evaluation
Standard 3: Organization and Governance
Standard 4: The Academic Program
Standard 5: Students
Standard 6: Teaching, Learning, and Scholarship
Standard 7: Institutional Resources
Standard 8: Educational Effectiveness
Standard 9: Integrity, Transparency, and Public Disclosure
Role of the Board of Trustees

From Standard Three: Organization and Governance
https://www.neche.org/resources/standards-for-accreditation/#standard_three

- The board has a clear understanding of the institution’s distinctive mission and exercises the authority to ensure the realization of institutional mission and purposes.
- The board systematically develops, ensures, and enhances its own effectiveness through orientation, professional development, and periodic evaluation.
- The board demonstrates sufficient independence to ensure it can act in the institution’s best interest. Members of the governing board understand, accept, and fulfill their responsibilities as fiduciaries to act honestly and in good faith in the best interest of the institution toward the achievement of its educational purposes in a manner free from conflicts of interest.

NECHE’s Virtual Visit October 4th-7th, 2020

- Above all, NECHE wants to ensure our
  - Educational Effectiveness
  - Financial Sustainability
- Educational Effectiveness: Core Questions
  - How do we measure and assess learning and student success?
  - How do we improve our practices based on this assessment?
- Financial Sustainability: Core Questions
  - Do we have sufficient resources to support our mission?
  - Is our multi-year financial plan realistic?
  - Do institutional and board leadership ensure the institution’s ethical oversight of its financial resources and practices?

NECHE’s Virtual Visit October 4th-7th, 2020

- How you can prepare:
  - Read the Self-Study
    - Focus on the narrative (not the supplementary material)
    - Be attentive to the projections
  - But remember...the NECHE visit is not a test!
    - They are interested in measuring the engagement of the Board
    - They are interested in candor
    - This is an opportunity for us to learn from our peers
NECHE’s Virtual Visit October 4th-7th, 2020

- One meeting is dedicated to the Board of Trustees
  - Save the time and date:
  - Monday, October 5th, 1:00-1:50 pm (Zoom link forthcoming)

Strategic Plan In-Depth Topic: Program Prioritization – (not discussed in lieu of time)

Other Updates – (none)

TRUSTEES EXCUSED
Trustee Perez was excused at 9:28 am

ADJOURNMENT
On a motion by Trustee Perez and seconded by Trustee Hebert it was VOTED to adjourn today’s meeting.

Roll Call Vote:
- Trustee Delgado Yes
- Trustee Hebert Yes
- Trustee Gi Yes
- Trustee Johnson Yes
- Trustee Parker Yes
- Trustee Plotkin Yes
- Trustee Vidal Yes
- Trustee Gilbert Yes

The meeting was adjourned at 9:33 am.

Respectfully submitted,

Karen Desjeans, Recording Secretary
Board of Trustees

Approved: Robert W. Gilbert, Jr., Chair, October 27, 2020